

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10640260 5



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
FACULTY OF LAW

## **FAMILY LAW**

### **Cases and Materials**

### **Volume II**

**Brenda Cossman  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**2022-2023**

\* \* \*

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*

KE  
538.5  
.C67  
2022  
v.2 c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 02 2022

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO



BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 02 2022

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# **FAMILY LAW**

## **Cases and Materials**

### **Volume II**

**Brenda Cossman  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**2022-2023**

\* \* \*

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use  
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*





Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2023 with funding from  
University of Toronto

## FAMILY LAW VOLUME II

### Table of Contents

Page No.

#### IV. THE ECONOMICS OF MARRIAGE BREAKDOWN

##### A. The Economics of Marriage

Statistics Canada “Study: Employment patterns of families with children, 1976-2014”, <i>The Daily</i> , June 24, 2015 .....	250
Statistics Canada, “Study: Women in Canada: Women and Paid Work”, <i>The Daily</i> , March 8, 2017 .....	252
Statistics Canada, “Household Income in Canada: Key results from the 2016 census”, <i>The Daily</i> , Sept 13, 2017 .....	253

##### B. The Economic consequences of Divorce

Note: the Economic Consequences of Divorce .....	255
Robert Leckey, “Families in the Eyes of the Law: Contemporary Challenges and the Grip of the Past” IRPP, <i>Choices</i> , vol 15(8), July 2009, at 7-9, 30 .....	256
“Incomes of Lone-parent Families” from Vanier Institute of the Family, <i>Profiling Canada's Families IV</i> , 2010, at 104-5 .....	257
Statistics Canada, “Children living in low-income households”, <i>Census in Brief</i> , Sept 13, 2017 .....	258

#### V. MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY

##### A. Historical Overview

###### (a) Common Law and the Regime of Separate Property

Ontario Law Reform Commission, <i>Report on Family Law, Part IV: Family Property</i> (1974) at 1-2 .....	260
---	-----

###### (b) Trust Doctrine

LRCC, Working Paper 8, <i>Family Property</i> (1975) at 9-11 .....	261
Note: The Doctrine of Resulting Trust .....	262
Donovan WM Waters, “The Doctrine of Resulting Trusts in Common Law Canada” (1970) 16 <i>McGill LJ</i> 187 at 188-191, 194-95, 199, 202, 205-7 .....	262
Note: <i>Murdoch v Murdoch</i> , [1975] 1 SCR 423 and <i>Rathwell v Rathwell</i> , [1978] 2 SCR 436 .....	265
<i>Pettkus v Becker</i> , [1980] 2 SCR 834 .....	268
“Woman’s Suicide Ends Fight for Rights”, <i>Globe and Mail</i> , Nov 12, 1986 .....	274
“Ontario Fee System Cited in Woman’s Legal Woe”, <i>Globe and Mail</i> , Nov 13, 1986 .....	275
“Payout ends tragic story of farm wife’s legal battle”, <i>Globe and Mail</i> , May 26, 1989 .....	277
Note: <i>Sorochan v Sorochan</i> , [1986] 2 SCR 38 .....	277
<i>Peter v Beblow</i> , [1993] 1 SCR 980 .....	279
Note: Constructive Trust after <i>Peter v Beblow</i> .....	282
<i>Kerr v Baranow</i> , 2011 SCC 10, [2011] 1 SCR 269 .....	289
Notes and Questions .....	312
Note: <i>Kerr v Baranow</i> on Rehearing, 2012 BCSC 122 .....	313
Alberta Law Reform Institute, “Property Division: Common Law Couples and Adult Interdependent Partners: Final Report” (June 2018) at 15-21 .....	318
(c) Statutory Reform and the “Partnership Principle”	
Winnifred Holland, “Reform of Matrimonial Property Law in Ontario” (1978) 1 <i>CJFL</i> 1 at 9-12 .....	321
John Eekelaar, “Adjustment on Divorce”, ch 6 in <i>Family Law and Social Policy</i> , 2 <sup>nd</sup> ed	



(1984) at 100-107 .....	322
<b>(d) Statutory Reform in Ontario: the 1978 FLRA to the 1986 FLA</b>	
Lorne Wolfson, <i>The New Family Law Act</i> (1987) at 2-7 .....	324
Note: 2009 Amendments to Part I of the FLA .....	326
<b>B. Part I of Family Law Act, 1986</b>	
<b>(a) Application</b>	
Note: Application of the FLA to Unmarried Couples .....	328
Note: Application of Matrimonial Property Law to First Nations Women.....	329
<b>(b) Overview of the Family Law Act</b>	
Ontario Law Reform Commission, <i>Report on Family Property</i> (1993) at 9-16 .....	332
Law Reform Commission of British Columbia, <i>Working Paper on Property Rights on Marriage Breakdown</i> (1989) at 74-78, 80-83, 85-86, 91-96 .....	335
<b>(c) Applying the FLA: Calculating the Equalization Payment</b>	
Susanne Goodman, “Matrimonial Property”, ch. 5 in LSUC, <i>Family Law</i> (Bar Admission Course Materials, 1999) .....	339
Note: Equalization Schemes and Bankruptcy (discussing <i>Schreyer v Schreyer</i> , 2011 SCC 35, [2011] 2 SCR 605).....	350
<b>(d) Valuation and Valuation Date Assets</b>	
<b>(i) Valuation Date</b>	
Note on cases.....	351
<b>(ii) Determining Ownership of Assets</b>	
M A Fredricks, “The Ownership Conundrum”, CBAO, <i>Matrimonial Affairs</i> , May 1990.....	354
<i>Korman v Korman</i> , 2015 ONCA 578.....	355
Note: <i>Holtby v Draper</i> , (2017) ONCA 932.....	360
Notes (including <i>Rawluk v Rawluk</i> , <i>Caratun v Caratun</i> , <i>Lowe v Lowe</i> , <i>Stone v Stone</i> and OLRC).....	361
<b>(iii) Valuation</b>	
Berend Hovius and Timothy Youdan, “Valuation of Property” from <i>The Law of Family Property</i> (1991) at 291-299.....	366
<i>Black v Black</i> (1988), 18 RFL (3d) 303 (Ont HC) .....	369
Susanne Goodman, “Tax Obligations and other Costs of Disposition” from LSUC, <i>Family Law</i> (Bar Admission Course Materials, 1999).....	370
Note: 2009 Amendments and Notional Disposition Costs .....	372
<b>(e) Deductions and Exclusions</b>	
Berend Hovius and Timothy Youdan, “Negative Net Family Property” from <i>The Law of Family Property</i> (1991) at 383-389 .....	373
Note (family loans—debt or gift?; contingent liabilities; hindsight evidence) .....	376
<i>Zavarella v Zavarella</i> , 2013 ONCA 720 .....	376
Note: <i>Jackson v Jackson</i> , 2013 ONSC 7884.....	381
<i>Folga v Folga</i> (1986), 2 RFL (3d) 358 (Ont HC .).....	381
Note: <i>Nahatchewitz v Nahatchewitz</i> (1999), 1 RFL (5 <sup>th</sup> ) 395 (Ont CA) .....	383
Note: <i>Linov v Williams</i> , 2007 CanLII 7407 (Ont SC) .....	384

Berend Hovius, “The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario” (2010) 29 <i>CFLQ</i> 119 at 124-27 (“Special Treatment of a Matrimonial Home in the Calculation of NFPs”).....	384
Note (differences in treatment of DOM property and excluded property).....	386
<i>Black v Black</i> (1988), 18 RFL (3d) 303 (Ont HC) .....	386
Note: Proposed Amendments to the FLA re Exclusions, Deductions and Special Treatment of the Matrimonial Home.....	387
Some Notes on Tracing Excluded Property (discussing <i>Oliva v Oliva</i> (1998), 12 RFL (3d) 334 (Ont CA), <i>Townshend v Townshend</i> , 2012 ONCA 868 and <i>Martin v Sansome</i> , 2014 ONCA 14) .....	388
<b>(f) Continued Relevance of Constructive Trust</b>	
Note .....	390
<i>Rawluk v Rawluk</i> , [1990] 1 SCR 70 .....	391
Note: Reverse Constructive Trust.....	397
Note: OLRC 1993 Recommendations .....	398
<i>Martin v Sansome</i> 2014 ONCA 14.....	399
Note: <i>Halliwell v Halliwell</i> , 2017 ONCA 349 .....	405
Berend Hovius, “Unjust Enrichment Claims by Spouses upon Marriage Breakdown: Achieving a Measure of Fairness or Causing Uncertainty and Complexity” (2014), 33 <i>CJFL</i> 140 at 170-172.....	406
<b>(g) Sample NFP Problems</b>	
Berend Hovius, “Sample Problems” from Hovius, <i>Family Law Cases and Materials</i> (1992), pp. 365-366.....	408
<b>(h) Departures from Equalization</b>	
<b>(i) Short Marriage</b>	
Berend Hovius, “Unequal Sharing of Net Family Properties under Ontario’s <i>Family Law Act</i> ” (2009) 27 <i>CFLQ</i> 147 at 177-182 (“Short Period of Cohabitation”) .....	409
<i>Pope v Pope</i> (1999), 42 OR (3d) 514 (Ont CA).....	411
<i>Gomez v McHale</i> , 2016 ONCA 318 .....	414
<b>(ii) Debts and Depletion of Assets (and Extent of Court’s Power under s. 5(6))</b>	
Berend Hovius, “Unequal Sharing of Net Family Properties under Ontario’s <i>Family Law Act</i> ” (2009) 27 <i>CFLQ</i> 147 at 170-177 (“Debts Incurred Recklessly or in Bad Faith” and “Intentional or Reckless Depletion of NFP”).....	417
Note: <i>Consentino v Consentino</i> , 2015 ONSC 271 .....	421
<i>Von Czieslik v Ayuso</i> , 2007 ONCA 305 .....	422
<b>(iii) Unequal Contributions</b>	
<i>LeBlanc v LeBlanc</i> [1988] 1 SCR 217.....	427
Kim Zarzor, “A New Day in a Hard Life”, <i>The Toronto Star</i> , Feb 16, 1988.....	430
<i>Berdette v Berdette</i> (1988), 14 R.F.L. (3d) 398 (Ont. H.C.) .....	432
Notes: <i>McInnis v McInnis</i> , unreported, Ont Gen Div 1990; <i>Martin v Martin</i> , 2007 2007CarswellOnt 683 (Ont SCJ), and <i>Dillon v Dillon</i> , (2010) ONSC 5858 .....	436
Berend Hovius, “Unequal Sharing of the Economic Gain During Marriage in Ontario: An Update” (2012) 31 <i>CFLQ</i> 155 at 170-171 (“Disparity in Contributions Before the Valuation Date”).....	437
Note: Tort Awards for Spousal Misconduct.....	438
<b>(iv) Effect of Special Rules Relating to the Matrimonial Home</b>	
<i>Ward v Ward</i> , 2012 ONCA 462 .....	439
<b>(v) Post-Separation Conduct and Anticipated Future Needs</b>	
Note: <i>Merklinger v Merklinger</i> , (1992), 43 RFL (3d) 109 (Ont Gen Div), aff’d.	



(1996), 26 RFL (4th) 7 (Ont CA); <i>Tamitegama v. Tamitegama</i> , unreported, 1993, Ont Gen Div. ....	441
Berend Hovius, “Unequal Sharing of Net Family Properties under Ontario’s <i>Family Law Act</i> ” (2009) 27 <i>CFLQ</i> 147 at 190-192 (“Abdication of Responsibilities & Other Conduct after Valuation Date”) .....	442
<b>(vi) <u>Post-Separation Changes in the Value of Property</u></b>	
<i>Serra v. Serra</i> , 2009 ONCA 105 .....	444
Berend Hovius, “Unequal Sharing of the Economic Gain During Marriage in Ontario: An Update” (2012) 31 <i>CFLQ</i> 155 at 174-176 (“Changes in Property Value After the Valuation Date”) .....	454
Notes and Questions .....	456
OLRC, <i>Report on Family Property</i> (1993), pp 68-71 .....	456

## VI. THE MATRIMONIAL HOME

### A. Introduction and Overview of Part II of the Family Law Act

Berend Hovius, “The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario” (2010), 29 <i>CFLQ</i> 119 at 119 (“Introduction”).....	458
Lorne Wolfson and Barry Corbin, “The Matrimonial Home Under the FLA” (1987), 2 <i>Money and Family Law</i> at 1-8.....	458
Note: <i>Debora v Debora</i> (2006), 33 RFL. (6 <sup>th</sup> ) 252 (Ont CA) .....	461
<i>MacFarland v MacFarland</i> , 2009 CarswellOnt 2949 (Ont SCJ).....	461

### B. Orders for Exclusive Possession

Berend Hovius, “The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario” (2010), 29 <i>CFLQ</i> 119 at 141-48, 150-54, 156 (“Orders for Exclusive Possession”) .....	466
<i>Pifer v Pifer</i> (1986), 3 RFL (3d) 167 (Ont Dist Ct).....	470
<i>Hill v Hill</i> (1987), 10 RFL (3d) 225 (Ont Dist Ct) .....	471
<i>Menchella v. Menchella</i> , 2012 ONSC 6304, 2012 CarswellOnt 13842 .....	474
Note: Groups Excluded from the Protections of Part II of the FLA.....	476
Berend Hovius, “The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario” (2010), 29 <i>CFLQ</i> 119 at 119-124 (“Occupation Rights of Common-Law Partners”).....	477
Note: Restraining Orders .....	478
Justice Geraldine Waldman, “The What and the Why of the Proposed Integrated Domestic Violence Court”, CBAO, 22 (2) <i>Matrimonial Affairs</i> , November 2010.....	479
Berend Hovius, “The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario” (2010), 29 <i>CFLQ</i> 119 at 157-160 (“Orders at Trial”).....	481





